

Heritage Conservation Practices and Challenges of Debre Yibabie Bale Egziabher Church in Janamora-Ethiopia

Getachew Melesse Asefa^{*}, Abay Mengistie Selamsew

Department of Tourism Management, University of Gondar, P.O. Box: 196 Gondar Ethiopia

^{*}Email: getachewmelesse2@gmail.com

Received for publication: 25 May 2021.

Accepted for publication: 07 October 2021.

Abstract

Heritage resources are being converted into destinations and attractions to obtain economic benefits from tourism throughout the world. The interference between heritage and tourism is extremely complex. Stakeholders interpret heritage in a variety of ways for different purposes. Ethiopia is gifted with a lot of cultural and natural heritage as tourist attraction areas. The Amhara region has many age-old rock hewn churches and other heritage sites which need conservation and protection from any dangers. The main objective of this study is to assess the heritage conservation practices and challenges of Debre Yibabie Bale Egziabher church in Janamora, Ethiopia. The study has been conducted by using a descriptive type of research design with a qualitative research approach. The researchers used the sample population of the study area through a purposive sampling technique. So, the participants in the study were the religious leaders, clergy, deacons, and knowledgeable elders in relation to the study area. Local government leaders as well as tourism experts were the target groups for the study to gather information about the church. The researcher has used research instruments to collect information like primary data via observations, interviews, focus group discussions, and reviews of secondary data sources. Moreover, the data Analysis of this research is conducted by categorizing, describing and interpreting the data collection from observation, participant detail interviews, focus group discussion, document and textual analysis and photographic data on the basis of thematic analysis. Furthermore, the researchers have identified the heritage conservation practices and challenges that have made a meaningful recommendation to reduce them. Preservation and maintenance have begun by the government and locals, yet the involvement of key actors is still very poor. On the other hand, due to age, environmental deterioration, improper handling of moveable treasures, lack of finance, deforestation, and lack of stakeholder integration, have been major challenges for the sites. Therefore, the researcher tried to recommend that the Church needs to get better protection and care. They need to be relieved of their problems and threats, so stakeholders should play their roles in an organized and integrated manner, unless otherwise it will become difficult.

Keywords: Heritage, Conservation, Practices, Challenges, Church

Introduction

Heritage is expressed as architectural works, works of monumental sculpture and painting elements or structures of an archaeological nature, inscriptions, cave dwellings and combination of features, which are an outstanding universal value from the point of history, art or science (Oras, ean, Ogreen, & Marginean, 2018). Therefore, Heritage is interpreted as the foundation of the present, the paths for the future, with the present generation as its custodians and the creative link.

Private and public sectors, whether or not in collaboration, are converting heritage resources across the globe into destinations and attractions in a bid or attempt to obtain a piece of the benefit

from tourism (Labadi & Long, 2010). Some argue that the globalization of heritage through tourism has led to a greater respect for culture than previously existed. However, the transformation of heritage properties into destinations and cultural expressions into performances is seldom straightforward. The interface between heritage and tourism is extremely complex. In a tourism setting, heritage can be misused in a variety of ways for a variety of purposes by a variety of stakeholders (Yujie, 2015).

For a long time, African heritage sites have been and are still under-represented on the World Heritage List. Therefore, even those sites that are listed, most of them are poorly managed and preserved, leading to nearly a section of them being placed on the list of World Heritage in danger. This is attributed to the fact that African countries lack the capacity, both human and capital, to prepare nomination profiles acceptable to the World Heritage Committee and also to manage the listed sites (Simon, 2014).

Ethiopia has endowed with enormous cultural and natural tourist attraction areas, (Ali, 2016). The number of people who travel to the Christian heritage sites and festivals is significant and worthy of study. Starting from the early years of Christianity in Ethiopia, pilgrimage is said to have been a major phenomenon. Religion plays an important part of life in Ethiopia. The Orthodox Tewahido Church ceremonies are unique and impressive (Abebe, 2019).

Christians' religious tourism or travel to religious sites is encouraging which constitutes the biggest share of domestic tourism in the country. Most of the religious tourism sites in Ethiopia belong to Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahido Church and most Churches and Monasteries are ancient and sources for studying Ethiopian civilization, history and literature. Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahido Church holds so many historical and religious heritages that are internationally significant (Ermias, 2014).

So far, Ethiopia has many Churches and Monasteries with their wonderful architectural values and artifacts. Deterioration of ancient buildings is caused not only due to the age of the rock hewn Church but also mainly because of several natural factors such as rainfall, temperature, wind blowing, and humidity that could cause destruction of the structures in the course of time.

Ethiopia's tourist attraction seems to emanate from man-made resources, and most of them embraced by Churches as well (Abebe, 2019). To achieve the economic value of the tourism industry, priority must be given to enhanced heritage conservation practices. Since natural and cultural heritages are rapidly deteriorating and vulnerable by a host of natural and man-made causes (Alubel 2018 as cited from Firdiyok, 2012).

Cultural heritage provides knowledge on our ancient history, society, way-of life and social norms and provides the foundation for technological advancement in all aspects of our lives (Fekadu, 2019). In addition, the conservation of built heritage is a driving force for maintaining the local identity and satisfying the sense of place and pride of society (Habtamu, 2018). But, conservation of cultural heritage may seem less of a priority compared than pressing issues such as infrastructure development, poverty alleviation, or job creation. Currently, heritage conservation practices and the institutional set-up is focused on the second level, which is coming next to Agriculture, Health and Education sectors in Ethiopia (Weldegiorgis, 2018). Additionally, Government tourism policies and strategies implementation is giving less attention to protect ancient heritage sites and resources.

The Amhara National Regional State, home of age-old rock hewn churches and other heritages situated on the Historic Route has the Lion's Share of the country's tourist attractions, still beautiful in this gracious region (Abebe, 2019 as cited from Sahile, 2011). Debre Yibabie Serebar Bale Egziabher Church is located in Janamora woreda, Ethiopia. Specifically, which is found in Serebaar Kebele which is one of the ancient and impressive churches in the area.

Methodology

The Research Design and Approaches

A descriptive type of research was used, a cross-sectional research design, which allowed the researcher to answer questions about a particular research problem in the Church. Descriptive research was used to obtain data resources on the current status of the situation and to describe what would have existed about the variables or conditions in the situation (Creswell, 2003).

Cross-sectional design gives a snapshot or a summary of the current situation on the variables of interest in the sample which is measured only once to establish the relationship between the sample and variables in the study. So, the current conservation practices and challenges of the Church in the study area were indicated through a cross-sectional research design (Singh, 2007).

The cross-sectional design is employed to describe systematically and accurately the facts and characteristics of a given population or area of interest and to provide an accurate account of characteristics of a particular individual, situation, or groups, such studies are a means of discovering new meaning, describing what exist, determining the frequency with which something occurs and categorizing information (Helen, 1993). To collect, analyze and interpret the data acquired from the spot and to describe the objectives of the study, researchers have applied the qualitative research approach.

Qualitative approach's goal is to address the 'how' and 'why' of a study and tend to use unstructured methods of data collection to fully explore the topic. It includes group discussions and interviews (Syed, 2016).

Target Population

The target populations in the study area were the religious leaders, priests, communities' representatives, Janamora woreda's government leaders, Kebele administrators and, Culture and Tourism office experts. Since this type of research should have been collected knowledge in the possession of a few individuals. As a result, the researcher used a non-probability sampling technique (it was a sampling technique in which the researcher selected samples based on the researcher's judgment rather than on random selection) to identify the participants who would have participated in the analysis as informants.

Sampling Techniques

A purposive sampling technique is used in this study. There is a different type of purposive sampling. So as to what the researcher has been determined for this study was 'Maximum Variation Sampling'. The idea behind Maximum Variation Sampling is to see at an issue from all available viewpoints, thus, succeeding a greater understanding, which is also known as 'Heterogeneous Sampling', it involves choosing participants across a wide-ranging, relating to the area of study, this type of sampling is useful when a random sample was not taken (Ilker et.al, 2016).

In this case, informants had been determined, based on their exposure, knowledge and closeness to the Church. In the purposive sampling approaches, there is no attempt to create a sample that is statistically representative of a population. Rather, people or target samples were selected with purpose. It enables the researcher to develop the research inquiry (Ross & Matthews, 2010).

Purposive sampling technique is practically synonymous with qualitative research method, where that person is located in a group is important (Palys, 2008). Furthermore, the purposive sampling technique is called a judgment sampling. It is a deliberate choice of informants due to the qualities the information possesses or holds. The researcher decides what need to be known and sets out to find people who can and where willing to provide the information by virtue or advantage of knowledge or experience (Dolores, 2007).

Purposive sampling is also important when information is held by only a certain member of the community (Dolores, 2007). The relevant information is obtained in the hands of few knowledgeable people in the research issues at the study area.

Therefore, researchers have targeted religious leaders 3, priests and deacons 7, elders 7, tourism experts 6, Government leaders at woreda level 4, Government leaders at kebele level 2 total participants were 29 people. All the target populations or informants are chosen on the basis of purposive sampling techniques. Meaning based on their proximity, skills, knowledge, experiences, duties, interest, and responsibilities of them about the study area.

The numbers of participants were determined on the level of data saturation. Data saturation means that it is related to the degree to which new data repeat what was expressed in previous data and no additional data are being found whereby the researcher can develop properties of the category (Sim, 2017).

Research Instrument

Researchers have used the descriptive research type which is the qualitative research approach. Moreover, researchers exercised the techniques to gather data like observation, interview, focus group discussion and review of secondary data sources as major instruments as illustrated below.

Site Observation

The first instrument was field observation. The researcher has taken this instrument in detail, which has given adequate time in the church. The researcher went to the church and stayed for a few days for the purpose of the study. Therefore, the researcher observed the status of the church based on the provided checklist.

The study area was assessed in depth according to the objectives of the study. It was a very essential instrument, particularly for these types of issues, since it allowed the researcher to obtain witness to what types of conservation practices and challenges exist in the study areas.

Therefore, after the researcher described a lot, enabling her to assure the objectives of the study and how the result would be valuable, the researcher obtained an opportunity to take a photo and write. After this process, the researcher was trying to obtain tangible and rational data.

Interview

The second tool which requires the proper procedures was an interview. Thus, the interview questions had been determined by the researcher. Questions were semi structured interview which was developed based on the research questions. These type of open-ended questions allows the informants to describe their emotions and ideas easily. A checklist would be developed for conducting the interview with key informants. Informants were selected based on purposive sampling techniques and then the researcher had expressed the objectives of the research briefly to minimize the errors during the data gathering time. Interviews were conducted in different places based on the agreement of informants for example, at the monastery, at the church, EOTC office, woreda administration office and tourism office.

Focus Group Discussion

The third tool was conducted using Focus Group Discussion. To carried out such instrument, the principles to involve at Focus Group Discussion was organized in the following way: participants were determined based on their exposures about the issues, knowledge and closeness to the church, volunteerism and it was arranged a total of two groups with 7 members in one group as well as 6 members in another group and it was conducted with tourism experts, religious and local Government leaders both woreda and kebele level. One of the most key instruments was conducting the focus group discussion. Focus groups were able to be used to gather collective and comprehensive

understanding from several individuals as well as to obtain organized views from the target people (Creswell, 2003). Thus, the researcher would be asked the participants by a small number of overall questions and collected responses from all individuals in the group.

Secondary Sources of Data

Secondary data was the fourth essential instrument for this study. It represents documents which were a good source for text data for a qualitative study. They were found for analysis without the essential transcription which was required with observational or interview data. It consisted of public and private registration that qualitative researchers obtained on a site or from the participants in a study, and they can include books, magazines, letters, brochures and proceedings (minutes of meetings). Therefore, this tool was working to examine and identify extra information regarding the study area.

Data Collection Methods

Data collection was one of the most important stages in conducting research. Qualitative data are mostly non-numerical and usually descriptive or nominal in nature. This means the data collected are in the form of words and sentences (Syed, 2016).

Therefore, researchers have tried to use both primary and secondary data gathering techniques in order to achieve the stated objectives of the study. Thus, Primary data collected during the course of doing the research of the descriptive type, then researcher has obtained primary data through observation and direct communication with participants.

The primary data source was carried out with target informants, which were Focus Group Discussion, observation of the church and interview based on semi-structure questions for the participants. So far, the participants in this research area were priests and other church members, religious leaders both woreda, church and monastery level, Woreda and kebele government concerned leaders and tourism experts at woreda level as well as knowledgeable individuals in relation to the church.

Furthermore, the research uses secondary data sources. The secondary data source would be obtained from written materials, books, magazines, minutes of meeting and other written materials.

Validity and Reliability

For the purpose of trusting the quality of the study, the reliability and validity of the data collected is conducted with a special care. The data which was gathered from primary and secondary sources has transcribed, compiled and elaborated in meaningful and arrangement information soon after the accomplishment of that particular data collection period. Validating findings meant that the researcher decides the accuracy of the findings through plans such as triangulation (Creswell, 2003). Triangulation is the cross checking of evidence that allowed the researcher to check for consistency and diminished the error (Priscila, 2003). Moreover, the researcher has triangulated the data collected through research instruments by using the original descriptions of the field notes so as to organize just as the data was gathered.

Results and Discussion

Historical Background of Debre Yibabie Bale Egziabher Church

Essentially, this church is a structure composed of a single rock. As explained through FGD, St. Lalibela has completed his spiritual education in Gojam province and has come to this sacred place to work in the Holy Field Church. Serebar Bale Egziabher was built on a large rock in the 11th century, which is far away, about 12 km southeast of Mekane Birhan town in Janamora Woreda. The church is situated on the highland of a hill in the red volcanic tuff, the same as the churches of Lalibela. *"The church is approximately carved, partly incomplete, because the builders tackled a*

challenge and were relocated towards Lalibela. A problem that Saints Lalibela left, when the devil told him that as his teacher died" (McEwan, 2013). The Debre Yibabie Serebar Bale Egziabher church is located about 12 km from the center of Janamora woreda, derived from a single rock and the pre-Lalibela structure of the church. Locals explain that this mysterious rock fragment of the rock was made by King Lalibela in the 11th century (Fentaye ,2018). According to the Janamora woreda culture and tourism office experts interviewed; "St. Michael sent around 50 people to help with the work of the Debre Yibabie Bale Egziabher Church. When St. Lalibela was building this wondrous church, the devil came to his working place and tried to disturb him. He said, 'Your father is dead, your mother is dead', but he didn't stop working and said nothing. Finally, he told 'your teacher is dead.'" Then he was angry and threw a rock-axe. When it was throwing the axe landed on Zoze Amba Giorgis in Belessa woreda today. "The researcher has observed that it is built on historical context and has a red-carved design with four columns and four entry doors. Currently, the three gates among the three columns are closed to each other and only one door is open to enter the interior part of the church, as shown in Figure 1 below.



Figure 1. The outward appearance of the church
Photo source: by researcher (on March 24, 2020)

As per observation, when entering towards the interior part of the church, fingerprints can be seen on this religious place clearly, which indicates the knowledge and wisdom of St. Lalibela' towards volcanic architecture. However, due to the age of this structure, the sun, the rain, and the day and night consequences are exposed for destruction of heritage, especially with the first 2 cross sculptures on the left side of the entrance being completely damaged, which are found on the right side of the entrance. However, some of them are clearly shown on the main entrance gate and that can be witnessed to church arts and architecture (in Figure 2 below).

As per observation in the field, the inside of the church can be found the 'Qinie Mahilet' of the church, its roof decorated with many impressive structures, shapes and sculptures as same as from the outside, the columns and doors are not too short. When you look up at the ceiling, you can see cross shapes, fresco paintings, and symbols that link the sun, moon, stars, and the various ele-

ments are printed (in Figure-3 below). Various works of art were placed on the rock and on the columns. These pillars do not differ in height, width, and shape from one column to the other as justified in Figure 5.



Figure 2. External columns visible and missing crosses
Photo source: by researcher (March 24, 2020)

During the FGD they depicted that the entire structure of the church is divided into 32 pillars, 6 windows, 3 gates and ‘Qinie Mahilet’, it is a place where deacons and priests pray, chant, and provide service for Christian orthodox church communities; ‘Qidist’ (the holy/sanctuary), is a place where both males and females pray and receive holy communion; and ‘Mekides’ (the holy of holies), here only allowed to enter; inside 5 person: 2 priests and 3 deacons, is required to celebrate church Mass. It is situated in the center of the church and is the place where the Ark of the Covenant is kept.



Figure 3 The interior of the Church with different symbols;
Source: by researcher (on March 24, 2020)

According to the Janamora woreda culture and tourism office, all the church manuscripts and artifacts are preserved and documented in scientific inventory and registration: ancient parchments, crosses and clothes. On the other hand, during the focus group discussion, the participants' depicted a thousand people assembled around the church to celebrate Christmas on January 7 of every year. Therefore, this festival is one of the treasures of the Church as one of the untouchable resources, as shown in Figure 4 below.



Figure 4. When the annual religious festival is celebrated
Source: by researcher (on March 24, 2020)



Figure 5. The image of the moon and the sign of crackling
Source: by researcher (on March 24, 2020)

Current Feature of the Church

As the researcher observed and realized, the exterior four columns are fragmented and the sculptures of the crosses on the pillars are partially damaging and destructing (see fig. 5 below). The

hill and terrace at the top of the church testifies that it is exposed to open grazing, soil erosion and water leakage and also as a burial place, which is exposed to soil degradation and to water penetration. *The church administrator stated the following; "-when you enter the interior of the church, you can observe very decorated art that were printed on 32 columns and roofs, but because of the natural and manmade factors: rainfall, and the movement of man and animals on the outside of the church, are caused by the sun, the moon, stars, and other religious artistic prints are clearly being harmed."*

As per observation, the ancient sacred books, the crosses and the various church costumes are placed in an unobtrusive position in the temple and do not have a separate place or museum for protection of treasures.

Heritage Conservation practices

Heritage is an expression of a community's civilization, development, lifestyle, political, social, economic, cultural and religious treasures and fingerprint (Fekadu, 2019). As Fekadu explained, the heritage from the past will be used as a tool for the learning and experience of the past, on the one hand, and to preserve the heritage for the next generation. To this end, the coordination and support of stakeholders plays an important role.

As explained through the result of group discussion, Debre Yibabie Serebar Bale Egziabher Church is a masterpiece of the pre-Lalibela Church and it is a footprint still intact there, which indicated the conservations work must be continued to minimize the problems.

As the priest of the church explained, stakeholders support with the Janamora Woreda Culture and Tourism Office, existing committee and the motivation of communities have started efforts to protect and preserve this church heritage. This committee has stopped the church's burial place on the hill completely and provided another place which laid it on a 5-hectare site, and also created awareness for the communities to keep it free of animal grazing and human contact. The government is trying to create awareness for the community to preserve and protect its heritage as well. The government action plan indicated through time that it has planned to be a tourist destination along with Simien Mountain national park through strengthening its protection and conservation in the future.

Woreda culture and tourism office head, stated as the following; "--fundraising effort to dress up by shed of the church, collecting revenue of four hundred thirty-three thousand birr from the community and five hundred fifty thousand birrs from the Regional Culture and Tourism Bureau a total of nine hundred eighty-three thousand birr have been collected and assigned professions by the department of research and conservation--." As FGD participants explained, heritage protection and preparations are underway to undertake the work with the Regional Cultural and Tourism Bureau, which, in coordination with other stakeholders, has appointed a heritage expert to dress up a shed and to save the heritage disaster. Thus, metal pillars and other required inputs are provided for the shed as shown in Figure 6.

Major Challenges of the church Conservation

Environmental Degradation: Degradation of the environment is a critical challenge for this single rock Church. The FGD, stated the following; *"The hill church terrace was exposed for grazing animals and used as a burial place of a community for long periods, because of that the church rocks are cracked and some of them turned into soil."* One church elder explained, the problem expanded the drainage because of high rainwater that causes flooding and soil erosion of the rock church. Thus, it needs to divert the canal to water drainage and minimize the accelerated erosion leakage of water (in Figure 7 below).



Figure 6 Iron pole
Source: by researcher (on march 24, 2020)



Figure 7 Seeing the damage to the interior walls and roof
Source: by researcher (on March 24, 2020)

Poor Involvement of Stakeholders: As head of Janamora Woreda Culture and Tourism Office (JWCTO) explained (interview), most stakeholders are not involved in maintaining and conserving the church; local people are involved in deforestation and overgrazing activities; inability to perform conservation activities due to skill and financial constraints; lack of support and follow-up from the governing bodies; lack of ownership of the leadership and community involvement.

Lack of finance: according to priests during group discussion, the church has a critical budget constraint to build a protective shed and to minimize sun and rain degradation and soil erosion of the main body of the church, though the church was founded by St. Lalibela before he built churches in Lalibela and Zoze Amba Giorgis in the 11th century (JWCTO, 2019).

Lack of Heritage Conservation and Management Plan: As the researcher observed, although Heritage committees' efforts are being encouraged to preserve and maintain the heritage, the heritage repairs and renewal committee has no guideline for a short-term and long-term heritage conservation and management plan. According to Amare, head of JWCTO through an interview, the office tries to support the strength of heritage committee's intentions, motivations and intervention, but the heritage management plan has not developed yet at the church or even at district level. Priests explained during group discussion, stakeholders' participation and coordination are very weak in protecting and maintaining heritage. The researcher found that the local community, the church administration, and the culture and tourism structures that have been trying their best to conserve and maintain the Church. While the office of priesthood/Church office at Woreda is the original owner of the church, it is not providing intellectual, moral and financial support to preserve and maintain the heritage.

Poor Shed Construction: As the researcher observed, the sustainability and reliability of sheds is another challenge for heritage conservation implementation. There is a supply of scaffolds and other necessary materials for church conservation collected, with the support of human laborers for the site as shown in fig. 8 below. However, it does not answer the question of whether the water leakage will permanently disrupt the flow and continuity of its heritage preservation.



Figure 8 Iron pillars for shed construction
Photo Source: by researcher (on March 24, 2020)

Declining the support of people: The local communities are starting to build new churches around their village instead of to support and use the original ruined and ancient church. Hence, all those people are focused to support and finish this new church. When the people move and maintain its ritual system from their worship in their surrounding area, the previous ancient church is being pushed/ ignored to the nearest community only. Hence, it's not able to strengthen the conservation and to collect financial support based on the total expenditure incurred for the shed work towards

the ancient rock church; rather peoples and heritage committees are dominated on the activities of the new started church.

Conclusion

The Debre Yibabie Serebar Bale Egziabher is a rock-hewn church built by St. Lalibela in the 11th century, and according to the evidence indicated, it was built before Zoze Amba Giorgis' rock-hewn Church and Lalibela's complex churches. It is believed that the first work of St. Lalibela was Basically, the Church is over nine hundred years old, but it is still impossible to know what knowledge and technology were being produced at the time, and spectacular, stunning, and dramatic religious and spiritual fingerprints have been left on us in a touching, tangible, and meaningful way. The church is located on a low hill with red soil and hard rock. St. Lalibela designed and built it from the south towards the north part of the hill, with wonderful artwork on the red rock. The southern part of the church has four columns and four doors, and the northern, eastern, and western parts of the church are linked to the mountain. The interior of Debre Yibabie rock-hewn church consists of 32 pillars, 6 windows, and three gates, with 3 doors, and is organized into three partitions: the sanctuary, the holies, and the holy of holies. Thus, inside the church, on the windows and on the ceiling, carved sculptures of the sun, moon, stars, crosses, and seals are still giving religious testimony or witness today. However, the rock hewn church has faced many challenges: environmental degradation and soil erosion, water leakage, lack of financial support, and poor heritage conservation and management are major problems. In order to keep the legacy of the authenticity of the heritage site to the next generation with its full features and religious significance, the problems must be solved.

So, to improve the challenges that are currently being faced on this ancient and historical church, all stakeholders should carry out the following recommendations.

- Protect the terrace of the church and its surroundings from human and animal contact to alleviate erosion and open grazing of animals.
- The community is responsible for the maintenance, conservation, and repair work, and to keep them engaged and possessed of their energy and knowledge, to gain the necessary awareness. Fundraising and making it available for conservation work.
- Repairs and maintenance heritage with the government, local community, and non-governmental organizations through creating and maintaining strong coordination.
- Build a museum to protect the artifacts around the church that allows the movable objects to be protected from damage and made safe and secure by the church and concerned individuals;
- Develop and implement a heritage conservation management plan by engaging the community where the artifacts are located.
- A professional study should be conducted to renew and repair the church. Professional follow-up and supervision are required before it begins conservation.
- Strengthen and support the community and the church administration by solving their knowledge and skills gap, supporting and skill-upping the work experience without interruption.

References

- Abebe, D. (2019). *Tourist motivation factors to the Christian heritages of Lalibela (Ethiopia)*, published in research gate. Accessed from <https://www.researchgate.net>
- Ali, Y. (2016). Challenge and Prospect of Ethiopian Tourism Policy. *Journal of Hotel & Business Management*, 5 (1)

- Alubel, W. & Yirdaw, A. (2018). Heritage Potentials and Management Challenges in Debre Tabor Town, Ethiopia: *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 7(3).
- Creswell, J. (2003). *Research Design: qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches*. (2nd ed). Retrieved from www. Isites.harvard.edu.
- Dolores, C. (2007). *Purposive Sampling as a Tool for Informant Selection*: Department of Botany, University of Hawai`i at Manoa, 3190 Maile Way, Honolulu, HI, 96822 U.S.A. and Institute of Biology, University of the Philippines, Diliman, Quezon City, 1101, PHILIPPINES
- Ermias, K. (2014). *Challenges of Religious Tourism Development: The Case of Gishen Mariam, Ethiopia*. The Hong Kong Polytechnic University
- Fekadu MS. (2019) The Existing Challenges of Heritage Management in Gondar World Heritage Sites: A Case Study on Fasil Ghebbi and the Baths. *J Tourism Hospit* 8:420. doi: 10.35248/2167-0269.19
- Fentaye et al, (2018). Magazine of North Gondar investment forum and launching ceremony of Debre Tabor University: Hagerie media communication plc
- JWCTO (Janamora Woreda Culture and Tourism Office), (2019). Janamora Tourism Attractions JWCTO, Janamora.
- Haftamu, A. (2018). *Conservation of Architectural Heritage and Historic Cities in Ethiopia; Case Study the Walled City of Harar, Jugol*. Ethiopian Institute of Architecture, Building Construction and City development, Addis ababa University
- Helen L. (1993). Descriptive research: *Journal of pediatric oncology nursing*, 10(4), 154-157
- Ilker E., Sulaiman, A., Rukayya, S. (2016). Comparison of Convenience Sampling and Purposive Sampling: *American Journal of Theoretical and Applied Statistics*, 5(1), 1-4. doi: 10.11648/j.ajtas.20160501.11
- Labadi, S., & Long, C. (2010). *Heritage and globalization*
- Matthews, B, & Ross, L (2010) *Research Methods: A Practical Guide for the Social Sciences*, Essex: Pearson Education, Canada.
- McEwan, D. (2013). *The story of Därsäge Maryam: The history, buildings and treasures of a church compound with a painted church in the Semen Mountains*
- Orascan, R., Ogorean, C., & Marginean, S. C. (2018). *Innovative Business Development--A Global Perspective: 25th International Economic Conference of Sibiu (IECS 2018)*. Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- Palys, T. (2008). Purposive sampling. In L.M. Given (Ed.) *The Sage Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods*. (Vol.2). Sage: Los Angeles, pp. 697-8.
- Priscilla M. (2003). *Validation of qualitative research in the "real world"*: <https://doi.org/10.1177/1049732303255686>
- Sahile, T. (2011). *Tourism Product Development in Hayek -North Central Ethiopia*. MA Thesis. Addis Ababa University.
- Simon, M. (2014). *The Management of Cultural World Heritage Sites and Development in Africa: History, Nomination Processes and Representation on the World Heritage List*. National University of Science and Technology, Bulawayo
- Singh, K. (2007). *Quantitative Social Research Methods*. First edition. Sage publication Inc. New Delhi, India.
- Syed, M. & Sajjad, K. (2016). *Methods of data collection*: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/325846997>.

- Weldegiorgis (2018). Heritage Conservation Challenges on the Rock-Hewn Churches of Tigray, Ethiopia an abstract of dissertation and a summary of dissertation review: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/>.
- Yechale, M. G., Haimanot, B. A., & Ashenafi, T. M. (January 31, 2017). Tourism marketing challenges and new tourism product development potentials: Practices from the Amhara National Regional State World heritage sites. *Journal of Hospitality Management and Tourism*, 8, 1, 1-13.
- Yujie, Z. (2015). *Heritage and Tourism*. Australian National University.